

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
401 F STREET NW SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, DC 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX
www.cfa.gov

MEETING OF THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

19 February 2004

10:30 AM CONVENE, Suite 312, 401 F Street, NW, Washington, D.C. 20001-2728

I. ADMINISTRATION

- A. Approval of minutes: 15 January 2004
- B. Dates of next meetings: 18 March 2004
15 April 2004
20 May 2004
- C. Revised schedule for the Commission's Executive Working Sessions.
- D. Report on the inspection of objects proposed for acquisition by the Freer Gallery of Art.
- E. Report on the WMATA's proposal for advertising in the Metro System.
- F. Report on the U.S. Mint's conference on coin design.
- G. Request from the Senate Appropriations Committee for testimony on the projects in Judiciary Square for the U.S. Court of Appeals and the National Law Enforcement Museum.

II. SUBMISSIONS AND REVIEWS

- A. American Battle Monuments Commission
[CFA 19/FEB/04- 1](#), World War II Normandy American Cemetery and Memorial. Omaha Beach, Colleville-sur-Mer, France. New visitors' center. Concept.

II. SUBMISSIONS AND REVIEWS continued, 19 February 2004

B. Department of the Treasury / U.S. Mint

1. [CFA 19/FEB/04- 2](#), Congressional Gold Medal for Dr. Dorothy I. Height.
2. [CFA 19/FEB/04- 3](#), Reverse design for 2004 platinum proof coin.
3. [CFA 19/FEB/04- 4](#), Fifty States circulating / commemorative quarter program for 2005. Designs for the Kansas, Oregon and Minnesota state quarter. (Previous: CFA 20/NOV/03-3).

C. District of Columbia Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs

Shipstead-Luce Act

- a. [S.L. 04-042](#), 2555 M Street, NW. Chancery for the State of Qatar . Facade alterations for new chancery. Concept. (Previous: S.L. 02-130, Sept. 2002).
- b. S.L. 04-040, The Portals 1201, 1301 and 1399 Maryland Avenue, SW. Phase I, New office building. Revised concept. (Previous: S.L. 02-001, CFA 18 Oct. 2001)
- c. S.L. 04-039, 1414 22nd Street, NW. Conversion of existing office building to condominiums with new facades. Concept.
- d. [S.L. 04-036](#), Tregaron (The Causeway). 3100 Macomb Street, NW (alternative address 3029 Kingle Road, NW). Plan for planned unit development. Concept.

D. Department of Defense / Department of the Navy

1. [CFA 19/FEB/04- 5](#), Naval Observatory and the Vice President's Residence. 34th and Massachusetts Avenue, NW. Perimeter security upgrades at the South Gate. Final.

II. SUBMISSIONS AND REVIEWS continued, 19 February 2004

2. CFA 19/FEB/04- 6, Washington Navy Yard. Anacostia River waterfront. Perimeter security fence. Final. (Previous: CFA 15/JAN/04- 3). POSTPONED
3. [CFA 19/FEB/04- 7](#), Anacostia Naval Station. Harden Firth Stirling Gate at South Capitol Street, SE. Perimeter security upgrades. Final.

E. Department of Defense / Department of the Army

[CFA 19/FEB/04- 8](#), Walter Reed Army Medical Center. 16th Street, Alaska Avenue and Georgia Avenue gates. Temporary canopies for security screening stations. Final.

F. Union Station Redevelopment Corporation

[CFA 19/FEB/04- 9](#), Union Station Parking Garage, H Street, between 1st and 2nd streets, NE. Garage expansion. Concept. (Previous: CFA 20/NOV/03- 7).

G. District of Columbia Housing Authority

[CFA 19/FEB/04- 10](#), Arthur Capper/Carrollburg Dwellings HOPE VI Project. The portion bounded by 3rd Street on the west, Virginia Avenue on the north, 7th Street on the east, and M Street, SE on the south. New Housing Complex. Information presentation.

H. District of Columbia Department of Parks and Recreation

[CFA 19/FEB/04- 11](#), New Community Center, 2809 15th Street and 1480 Girard Street, NW. New four-story building. Final. (Previous: CFA 16/OCT/03- 16).

II. SUBMISSIONS AND REVIEWS continued, 19 February 2004

I. District of Columbia Department of Consumer and Regulatory Affairs

1. Old Georgetown Act

Appendix I.

2. Shipstead-Luce Act

Appendix II.

III. INSPECTION

Ray Kaskey's studio, the maquettes for the last six [bas-relief panels](#) for the National World War II Memorial.

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear General Herrling:

During its meeting of 19 February 2004, the Commission was pleased to meet you for the presentation of the preliminary concept design for the new interpretive center at the World War II Normandy American Cemetery and Memorial. The design, as presented by Colden Florence of the Smith Group, was well received by the members and was unanimously approved.

During the review, there were several items mentioned that should be noted for additional consideration. The first was the orientation pavilion, adjacent to the parking lot, at the southern end of the proposed new building. As the first stop for the visitor to the cemetery, this will be a critical element to help those touring the grounds and to guide them to the new center's main entrance. The approach to the pavilion on the path from the parking lot will be an important factor in its success. Great care should be given to its design.

The second item was the configuration of the parking lot itself. Every strategy to shield the vehicles from view and, most important, to visually reduce the size of the lot should be employed. The notion of dividing it into several "rooms" seems to be an appropriate design direction. Adequate landscaping in and around the lot will be needed to achieve the desired effect.

The importance of the project's overall landscape design cannot be stressed enough. A harmonious transition from the existing grounds of the cemetery and memorial to that of the indigenous countryside surrounding the new building must be provided. Future approvals for this project will be dependent on the resolution of the landscape design as well as the architectural design. The next submission for design development should include a concept for the landscape design.

The Commission looks forward to the review of the project as the designs develop. Please forward them at your earliest convenience. Should questions arise, the staff is available to provide guidance.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Major General John P. Herrling
Secretary, American Battle Monuments Commission
Courthouse Plaza II, Suite 500
2300 Clarendon Boulevard
Arlington, Virginia 22201

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Ms. Fore:

The Commission of Fine Arts reviewed designs for a Congressional Gold Medal honoring Dr. Dorothy I. Height at its 19 February meeting. I am happy to tell you that it was approved with the following recommendations:

Obverse: Additional texture on Ms. Height's hat at the top of the outer edge would avoid the appearance of a halo.

Reverse: In order to accommodate all the elements Ms. Height wants on the reverse, and still produce a good, "readable" design, the Commission recommends starting with design #8 and making the following changes: Make the inscription smaller and remove ribbon ends; simplify the building, making it a more truly linear representation; remove most of the items in the setting, including the background building, street light, wall and trees; add at the bottom: "The Dorothy I. Height Leadership Institute".

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Ms. Henrietta Holsman Fore
Director, United States Mint
801 9th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20220

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Ms. Fore:

The Commission of Fine Arts reviewed designs for the 2004 reverse of the Platinum Bullion Coin at its 19 February meeting and approved design #4, one of those based on Daniel Chester French's sculpture, "America".

The recommendation was that the design be kept as simple as possible, considering the difference in scale between the very large original sculpture and the small size of the coin on which the adaptation will appear.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Ms. Henrietta Holsman Fore
Director, United States Mint
801 9th Street, NW, 8th Floor
Washington, DC 20220

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
401 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Ms. Fore:

At its meeting of 19 February, the Commission of Fine Arts reviewed reverse designs for the Minnesota, Oregon, and Kansas state quarters. The recommendations were as follows:

Minnesota: Design #4 was approved, with the recommendation that the trees in the background be removed, leaving only the men in the canoe and the loon in the foreground. It was thought that the water could be studied further, to give it more definition.

Oregon: A variation of Design #3 was approved, using just a large fish in the center of the coin.

Kansas: Design #3, with only a large sunflower in the center of the coin and no other elements, was approved.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

The Honorable Henrietta Holsman Fore, Director
United States Mint
801 9th Street, NW, 8th Floor
Washington, D.C. 20220

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Ambassador Al-Dafa:

During its meeting of 19 February, the Commission reviewed the proposed concept of facade alterations for a new chancery for the State of Qatar at 2555 M Street, NW. Although the Commission encourages the desire to create and emphasize a new entrance to the chancery, additional design alternatives and detailing for the entrance should be investigated. The new additions and alterations should be a contemporary design and fully integrated with the existing structure. It will be very important to develop the architectural details carefully to achieve this desired result. It is hoped that some elements could be included that are expressive of the culture of the State of Qatar.

The State of Qatar is a distinguished member of the international community and deserves a building that is a fitting expression of this role. The Commission looks forward to further review of this project. The staff is available to assist as needed.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

His Excellency Bader Omar Al-Dafa
Ambassador to the State of Qatar
Embassy of the State of Qatar
4200 Wisconsin Avenue, NW, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20016

cc: Barbara A. Mullenex, OPX Architects

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
401 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

25 February 2004

Dear Mayor Williams:

During its meeting of 19 February, the Commission reviewed the concept for a Planned Unit Development (PUD) on the Tregaron Estate (S.L. 04-036), consisting of sixteen (16) single family dwellings and associated infrastructure. The proposed site plan was approved. This project may prove to be a model for sensitive estate development throughout the country. The developer is to be commended for selecting an exceptionally competent team, who made a thorough and compelling presentation of the project. Although the Commission understands the concerns of the community regarding the possible degradation of the existing fragment of the historic Ellen Shipman landscape design, the project has considerable promise to restore large portions of the landscape and rescue it from benign neglect. In addition, the architecture and infrastructure have been carefully sited to preserve the current and future health of as many trees as possible.

As the project develops, the Commission requests the consideration of some concerns. Because of the importance of the historic landscape, a reduction in the number of dwellings should have further study, provided the landscape restoration and other community amenities remain as part of the development. In addition, the Commission will be interested in the provisions ensuring future maintenance of the restored landscape. Finally, the grading and location of the road should be carefully studied with regard to tree and open space conservation. Final approval of this proposal will be dependent on the resolution of these landscape issues.

All future submissions should contain extensive information with regard to the landscape design and restoration, as well as continued development of the architecture. Please have the applicant keep the staff informed on any significant changes to the proposed development. The Commission looks forward to continued review of the Tregaron PUD as the architecture and landscape design develops.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

The Honorable Mayor Anthony Williams
Mayor of the District of Columbia
John Wilson Building
1350 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
6th Floor
Washington, DC 20004

cc: Cynthia A. Giordano, Arnold & Porter, LLP
Steve Callcott, D.C. Historic Preservation Office
Craig Curtis, Miller Hull Partnership
Sheila Brady, Oehme, van Sweden & Associates

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Mr. Earle:

During its meeting 19 February 2004, the Commission reviewed a number of security improvements at the Naval Observatory and the Anacostia Naval Station. We appreciated the opportunity to visit the Washington Navy Yard on the morning of the meeting and look forward to further review of the concept design for the proposed perimeter security fence along the Anacostia River waterfront at your earliest convenience.

While the security upgrades at the Main Gate and the Gillis Avenue Gate for the Vice President's House at the Naval Observatory site are still under review, the improvements to the South Gate were approved. The site conditions at the South Gate are quite different from the other two gates and made the implementation of the barricades and new guard house feasible.

The same can be said of the Harden Firth Stirling Gate to the Anacostia Naval Station off South Capitol Street, SE. The placement of the security barricades behind the existing iron gates is preferable to having them be so noticeable as in other installations. By keeping the existing guard booth and fence, the addition of new bollards in this location were considered acceptable.

The Commission looks forward to continued dialogue with you and your consultants on the options available to the Navy to meet the security requirements in the various installations throughout the capital city.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Mr. Lawrence P. Earle
Department of the Navy
Washington Navy Yard
Engineering Field Activity Chesapeake
1314 Harwood Street, SE
Washington, DC 20374-5018

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Mr. D'Amico:

During its meeting of 19 February 2004, the Commission reviewed the concept design for the installation of temporary canopies at the entrances to the Walter Reed Army Medical Center to shelter the security screening operations at the gates. The members did not approve the designs as presented. However, the Commission did not object to the use of temporary canopies as an interim measure until a permanent solution is devised, approved and constructed. What was found to be objectionable in the schemes presented was the overbearing height, width, and industrial character of the canopy system presented. Every effort should be made to reduce their overall dimensions without impacting the screening operations.

Considering that these canopies will be in place for two to five years, and will be the first item visitors and patients encounter when entering the hospital center, the interim canopy system should have some visual and esthetic value—it should not look or feel like a secured industrial plant. Perhaps a more tent-like cable-stayed canopy system would be more appropriate and interesting. The Commission looks forward to the review of alternative designs. The staff is available to assist as needed.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Mr. Michael A. D'Amico
Director of Public Works and Transportation
Department of the Army
Walter Reed Army Medical Center
Washington, DC 20307-5001

cc: Louise Brodnitz, WRAMC

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Mr. Ball:

The Commission was pleased to meet with you on 19 February 2004, to review the concept designs for the addition to the parking garage at Union Station. The contemporary approach to the design of the facades of the addition was well received, as were the changes to the facades of the existing structure. However, before we can comment on the proposed stainless steel mesh screening panels and their illumination, it will be necessary to have the opportunity to review a sizeable material sample installed on site. The staff is available to assist you in coordinating a site inspection of the sample mockup at your earliest convenience.

It was also felt that the proposed screening of the existing exposed truss on the south facade is not appropriate or necessary. However, the installation of a sensitively scaled and detailed sign in this location would be acceptable. We look forward to the review of the design development.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Mr. David S. Ball, President
Union Station Redevelopment Corporation
10 G Street, NE, Suite 504
Washington, DC 20002

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Mr. Kelly:

During its meeting of 19 February 2004, the Commission appreciated the information presentation for the Arthur Capper/Carrollsborg HOPE VI Housing Development planned between 3rd, 7th and M Streets, SE and Virginia Avenue. The members support this important housing initiative to rebuild and revitalize this long neglected and distressed public housing complex. The District of Columbia Housing Authority and the Department of Housing and Urban Development should be commended on the innovative HOPE VI program to redevelop and renew these troubled communities.

Although the Commission encourages the development of mixed-income housing and understands the disenfranchisement felt by many of the current residents, there is a continued concern about the propagation of quasi-historic architecture, in the recreation of the "Capitol Hill" effect. This project has the opportunity to reflect the best of contemporary architecture, giving the community a responsive new design rather than a recapitulation of traditional design vocabulary.

The Commission looks forward to review of other projects for the District of Columbia Housing Authority.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Mr. Michael P. Kelly
Executive Director
DC Housing Authority
1133 North Capitol Street, NE
Washington, DC 20002

cc: Paul Rowe, DCHA
Wayne S. Quin, Holland & Knight, LLP

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear Ms. Franklin-Kelly:

During its meeting of 19 February 2004, the Commission reviewed and approved the final design for the new community center to be located at 15th and Girard Streets, NW. However, reconstruction of a historic facade remnant will not improve the quality of the design and should be seriously reconsidered.

The Commission looks forward to review of other projects for the District of Columbia Parks and Recreation Department.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

Ms. Lisa Franklin-Kelly
Chief of Capital Projects
Department of Parks and Recreation
3149 16th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20010

cc: Michael Winstanley, Leo A Daly

THE COMMISSION OF FINE ARTS

ESTABLISHED BY CONGRESS 17 MAY 1910

NATIONAL BUILDING MUSEUM
441 F STREET, N.W., SUITE 312
WASHINGTON, D.C. 20001-2728

202-504-2200
202-504-2195 FAX

27 February 2004

Dear General Kelley:

During its meeting of 19 February, the Commission received a report from two of its members on their site inspection to Ray Kaskey's studio before the meeting, to examine the last set of six bas-relief panels for the National World War II Memorial. In addition, the staff circulated photographs of the panels that were taken several days earlier. After reviewing the images, the members were very pleased with Mr. Kaskey's efforts and the Commission approved the panels with the recommendation that the words on the newspaper depicted in the V-J Day panel be reconsidered. Perhaps the newspaper should be changed to read simply "War Over."

The Commission looks forward to the dedication of the new memorial.

Sincerely,



Charles H. Atherton
Secretary

General Paul X. Kelley, USMC (Ret.)
Chairman, American Battle Monuments Commission
Courthouse Plaza II, Suite 501
2300 Clarendon Boulevard
Arlington, VA 22201

cc: Ray Kaskey
General John Herrling, ABMC
William B. Owenby, ABMC
Terry Carlstrom, National Park Service
John Parsons, National Park Service